

# Tanzanian Affairs



Issued by the Britain-Tanzania Society  
No 118 Sept 2017

**Mining Sector - The Mineral  
Sands Export Saga**

**Challenge to Schooling Ban for  
Pregnant Girls**

**Key “Escrow” Suspects Arrested**

## Roger Nellist: **THE MINERAL SANDS EXPORT SAGA**

### **Tanzania's mining sector in difficulty - the background**

As reported in TA117, in March the government took the controversial step of banning the export of mineral concentrates and ores for metallic minerals such as gold, copper, nickel and silver. Later the same month, President Magufuli had intervened personally, ordering the seizure at Dar port of 277 containers of mineral sands destined for export mainly from two gold mines operated by Acacia Mining (Tanzania's largest gold-producer), and asserted: "There is no country being robbed of its mineral wealth like Tanzania". Samples were taken from the sands for analysis. Several foreign mining companies were immediately affected by the export ban but local miners and other entities also expressed concerns. In April, Magufuli established two expert teams to report to him quickly on different aspects of the mineral sand exports. Since then the saga has intensified, triggering an avalanche of robust follow-up actions by government – including more sackings and contentious new legislation.

Tanzania is variably listed as Africa's third or fourth largest gold-producing country so, unsurprisingly, the saga has generated much news coverage and comment, both in Tanzania and abroad. There have been headlines like: "Industrial-scale plunder of Tanzania's mineral wealth by multinational companies", "Probe team unearths massive thievery in mineral sand exports", "Tanzania has been losing trillions of shillings in revenue" and "Tanzania's Acacia spat shows deepening battle with business".

### **Two Presidential probe reports**

President Magufuli received the two reports in person at State House, presented by the respective expert teams, with the presentations broadcast live on national media. The first took place on 25 May, led by Prof A. Mruma, the head of the Geological Survey of Tanzania. Their report found that the containers impounded at Dar's port held real minerals with a value totalling up to TSh 1.4 trillion that had not been declared for tax or recorded by the Tanzania Minerals Audit Agency (TMAA). Minerals discovered in the concentrates included gold, silver,

---

*cover photo: Miner at Bulyanhulu Gold Mine (photo Acacia Mining)*

copper metal and sulphur, as well as quantities of undeclared strategic minerals like lithium. The team said it found an average of 1.4kg of gold per tonne of mineral sand in the containers, seven times as much as reported by TMAA. It also uncovered other discrepancies. Mruma's committee recommended that the export ban on metallic mineral concentrates be maintained, effective scanners be installed at Dar's port, containers be sealed immediately after testing, that government should ensure smelters are built in Tanzania to maximise the full value of minerals produced and that disciplinary action should be taken against officials in the Ministry of Energy & Minerals (MEM) and in the TMAA.

On 12 June Magufuli received the second report, concerning the economic impact of the mineral sands exports. This team, led by Prof N Osoro, estimated that between 44,000 and 61,000 containers of gold and copper concentrates had been exported between 1998 and March 2017, most emanating from two mines run by Acacia (formerly Barrick Gold). It estimated losses in government revenue running into trillions of shillings over the two decades – through under-declaration of both export volume and value of gold and copper concentrates. Magufuli announced: "The report says the amount of unpaid taxes between 1998 and March 2017 through illegal exports of gold and copper concentrates is between TSh 68.59 trillion and TSh 108.5 trillion". Such sums would be enough to cover Tanzania's national budget for three years and build about 1,000 kms of railway line between Dar and Mwanza. Describing the losses as "criminal", Osoro's committee made 21 far-reaching recommendations – principally that: responsible senior public officers (past and present) should be charged with complicity in tax evasion, abuse of public office, economic sabotage and fraud; all Mining Development Agreements (MDAs) and mining laws should be reviewed; all new MDAs should be approved by parliament and the terms of all MDAs should be made public; government should take a stake in all large mines; overly generous tax concessions should be removed; and there should be strengthened security at mines to reduce smuggling.

### **The government's response**

Inevitably, the two reports produced very strong reactions from many quarters, including demands for a major overhaul of Tanzania's mining laws and arrangements. In a parliamentary session after the first report, MPs were close to unanimous in expressing their shock. They offered

#### 4 *The Mineral Sands Export Saga*

many suggestions on what should be done and called for officials in MEM “who have been telling lies” to be investigated. They also called for Energy & Minerals Minister Sospeter Muhongo and his Deputy Minister to be held to account for the mistakes of their subordinates and, since the scandal has been ongoing for years, for his predecessors to be investigated too.

President Magufuli took quick action. Immediately after publication of the first report he cancelled Muhongo’s appointment as Minister, saying “The Minister is my friend but I want him to reconsider his position .... I am advising him to step down”. State House indicated that there would be no immediate replacement for him. Magufuli also dissolved the Board of TMAA and suspended its CEO. These sackings came on top of the earlier dismissal of MEM’s Permanent Secretary, allegedly for lying to parliament about the concentrates.

The President was incensed after receiving the second report on the revenue losses. Saying he was left “utterly speechless” by its findings, in a televised response he declared: “Enough is enough. We have been given raw deals for too long and this has to end. ... Even the devil is laughing at us over our own self-inflicted level of poverty amid natural wealth given to us by God.” He demanded that Acacia Mining – if it wanted to continue mining in the country – pay billions of shillings in tax due since 1998 as arrears and dared the company to sue his government. Calling on Acacia to repent, Magufuli said he would not discuss anything with the company whilst debts were pending. He ordered that all 21 recommendations made in the Osoro report be implemented immediately. In early July he went further, ordering MEM not to issue any new mining licences or to renew expiring ones.

On 14 June, with only a few dissenting voices, parliament passed a resolution praising Magufuli for his actions. One MP said “this is war.... economic war”.

Then on 3 and 4 July Parliament considered and approved three hastily-prepared bills tabled by the Minister for Constitutional and Legal Affairs, Prof P. Kabudi. The three Acts (see below) make amendments to six existing laws (including the Mining, Petroleum and Income Tax Acts) aimed at strengthening government control of Tanzania’s mineral and petroleum sectors and increasing revenues from extraction activities in those sectors.

The Natural Wealth and Resources (Permanent Sovereignty) Act 2017 asserts that all natural resources belong to Tanzania and will be used only to benefit the country. It requires all disputes between the government and investors to be settled in Tanzania (no foreign arbitration) and compels companies to process minerals within the country rather than exporting them as raw materials; mineral concentrates if not smelted by the producer will be sold to whoever is able to smelt them in Tanzania and pay taxes due. We understand that this Act also allows government to own up to 50% of mining firms, and requires all earnings from the exploitation of natural resources to be banked in Tanzania (foreign mining companies may remit dividends only).

The Natural Wealth and Resource Contracts (Review and Renegotiation of Unconscionable terms) Act, 2017 requires all natural resource contracts to be made public, that parliament must endorse them, and allows the government to revoke contracts if they have “unconscionable terms” or are otherwise prejudicial to the interests of Tanzanians.

The Written Laws (Miscellaneous Amendments) Act 2017 dissolves the TMAA and replaces it with a Minerals Commission (with most of its nine members being serving Permanent Secretaries).

The debate on the three Bills, rushed through parliament in just two days, was heated, with many differing views expressed. CCM MPs supported their immediate consideration but opposition MPs questioned the urgency, arguing for more time for their public and parliamentary scrutiny. One CCM MP cautioned that “these are revolutionary measures. We need to understand what we are getting in to. ... Multinationals may decide to pull out from our country and adversely affect our current account and the value of the Tanzanian shilling”. He added that to balance the risk of such negative outcomes from “our economic freedom fight” the government should invest more in small-scale mining.

### **The mining industry’s response**

Acacia Mining operates three mines in Tanzania. Whilst its Mara North mine produces almost pure gold (and was not the subject of the probes) its two other gold mines (Bulyanhulu and Buzwagi) produce mixtures and were investigated. The company announced in April that the concentrate export ban was costing it about \$1 million daily, and its shares fell on the FTSE 250 Exchange.

After the first probe report findings were publicised Acacia's share values dropped by more than 15% in minutes. The company stated it had fully co-operated with the committee and maintained it fully declares everything of commercial value and pays all appropriate royalties and taxes on all payable minerals produced.

After the release of the second report's findings Acacia called for an independent review of both Presidential committee reports, asserting that they contained inaccurate and unexplainable findings and allegations. It strongly refuted the "unfounded accusations", insisting it is a law-abiding company, mining in full compliance with Tanzanian laws, paying all royalties and taxes due and publishes fully audited accounts. It called for a lifting of the mineral sands export ban (saying it was hurting its ability to conduct business in Tanzania and also badly affecting the lives of thousands of Tanzanians) and called for a resolution of the current situation. Over the last 20 years Acacia/Barrick has invested US\$4 billion in Tanzania's mining sector. In all, Acacia's shares are now priced at less than half of their value of twelve months ago.

Within days of the second report being presented to the President, the Executive Chairman of Acacia's majority shareholder, Barrick Gold Corporation of Canada, flew to Dar to hold talks with Magufuli. He said he wanted to help resolve the problems and, after the discussions, he and Magufuli announced they will establish two expert teams to begin negotiations to that end. The Chairman said he was optimistic about reaching a solution – one that will involve payment of any past dues and also arrangements for establishing a smelter in Tanzania. Acacia said it would not participate directly in the government-Barrick talks but would work to support Barrick.

On 4 July, before the new legislation had been signed into law by the President, Acacia filed arbitration notices in Tanzania in order "to protect the company". It reiterated that "Acacia remains of the view that a negotiated resolution is the preferable outcome to the current disputes and the company will continue to work to achieve this". It is understood that production continues at Acacia's three mines.

All other mining companies in Tanzania will also be impacted by the government's recent actions. The Tanzania Chamber of Minerals and Energy, representing the industry, said the implications of the new laws

(which it had opposed) are “vast”, adding that “the industry is going to be affected big time” and that it will need extensive legal advice.

External commentators are expressing concerns that, even though Magufuli has said the private sector is “an important ally”, his robust actions will unsettle other investors. One pointed to the US\$ 19 billion of major infrastructure projects the government has in the pipeline and for which it needs private investors, reminding that other large private investment projects in Tanzania have also been jeopardised this year. Another commentator opined that Tanzania’s mining sector is deteriorating from a situation of relative stability and sense to becoming “yet another African basket case”.

Naomi Rouse:

## EDUCATION

### **Civil Society ready to challenge the President on controversial education policy**

The unequivocal statement by President Magufuli banning pregnant girls and young mothers from attending school is a setback for the ‘re-entry’ policy that had gained growing momentum in recent years. However, Tanzanian civil society and others are mobilising to oppose the ban.

The familiar arguments have been brought out: a breakdown in morality, an epidemic of pregnancies and classrooms full of pregnant girls, if you start to allow any young mothers to return to school. One CCM MP, Mr Keisy, envisaged a slippery slope towards liberalism: “We are supposed to be firm on these issues otherwise we will find ourselves approving same-sex marriage”. On the other hand, civil society organisations are highlighting girls’ vulnerability and prevalence of forced sex, girls’ constitutional rights to education, and the benefits to the whole community if pregnant girls are allowed to continue their education.

There is not an overt religious element to the debate, though one MP argued that “all religions are against this... after all, we have stringent legislation on this issue, why are we diverting from it? Why should we jail amorous men, but allow errant girls back to school?”

Opinions have not been split on gender lines, with some male politicians speaking out in support of the re-entry policy, and high-profile women



*Schoolgirls at Zanki Primary School, Dar es Salaam (Sara Farhart/World Bank)*

opposing it, including former First Lady Salma Kikwete. However sexist arguments abound in the debate. One CCM MP challenged women MPs to tell the house if they started to engage in sexual activity while still in school. President Magufuli himself said the country would “reach a time when all the pupils in a class will be mothers and when it is time for learning they will need to go to breast-feed their children at their home”.

Salma Kikwete is perhaps a surprising opponent of girls returning to school, having established a high-profile women’s rights foundation, WAMA (Wanawake Maendeleo), with the mantra “treat every child as your own.”

Ms Nyimbo (Special Seats – CCM) pointed out in the parliamentary debate, political opposition to the re-entry policy is hypocritical because of vast disparities of wealth and power. “The fact is that if the daughter of an MP or any other well-to-do person gets pregnant while in school, chances are that that will not be the end of their educational journey. They are sure to be sent back to school after giving birth. Why should we lock out girls from poor families? How can we end the vicious cycle of poverty? Let’s be fair.”

There is a lot at stake. 55,000 girls are officially recognised to have left



school due to pregnancy in the past decade, though this is likely to be significantly under-estimated. The most recent Tanzania Demographic Health Survey shows that 27 out of 100 girls in Tanzania have become pregnant by the age of 18. It is in no one's interest to exclude girls from education, given the powerful benefits of education for girls' income, family size and their ability to care for their families. In addition to the very pressing issue of sexual violence against girls, the question of reproductive health services for young people is still the elephant in the room.

Magufuli's insistence that young mothers will never be allowed back to school while he is in power is a real test for Tanzanian civil society. A group of 26 organisations issued a joint statement against the ban, including one representing a further 50 member organisations. This is a sign that civil society action is better coordinated and has a stronger and more unified voice than in the past, but it could be a tough fight.

### **STOP PRESS: Policy draws criticism from African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights**

On 03 August 2017, the ACHPR Commissioner Rapporteur on the Human Rights Situation in the United Republic of Tanzania and the Special Rapporteur on the Rights of Women in Africa, together with the Chairperson of the African Committee of Experts on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, transmitted a Joint Letter of Appeal to the President of the United Republic of Tanzania regarding the statement made on 22 June 2017 to the effect that pregnant girls and teen mothers will not be allowed to attend school. The Joint Letter of Appeal expressed the view of the Commission and Committee that this statement runs the risk of undermining the right to education and the right to equality of girls, and urged the State to fulfil its obligations concerning these rights in terms of the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, the Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa and the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child.

### **Summary of media coverage of the issue**

#### ***MPs split on proposal to allow teenage mothers back to school***

Parliament was divided on the proposal to allow young mothers back

to school. The Social Services and Community Development Committee and the Opposition party are pushing for a change in the policy. Former First Lady Salma Kikwete was one of the high profile opponents of the policy. Support for the policy emphasised girls' welfare whereas those opposing the policy urged the importance of maintaining an 'ethical society' and protecting Tanzania's culture and customs, which prohibit sex before marriage. (*The Citizen*)

### ***JPM: No going back to school once you become a mother***

Speaking at a ceremony to open the new Bagamoyo-Msata road, President Magufuli spoke out against allowing girls back to school, on the grounds that this would encourage other girls to be sexually active without worrying about the consequences. Magufuli dismissed the advocacy work of NGOs and said that they should open their own schools for pregnant girls, and that the government would never accept the girls back in government schools. (*The Guardian*)

### ***Women react to Magufuli's pregnant schoolgirl ban***

An online petition has been set up and a pan African Women's organisation is mobilising to get Magufuli to apologise and reverse his comments regarding education of young mothers.

Jackie Lomboma, spoke out about her personal experiences, saying "It is a big disappointment to hear such a statement from our President". Jackie became pregnant when she trusted a boy who promised to ask his parents to help fund her secondary education. She was kicked out of school and home, later getting the chance to go back to school. She has since set up a centre for teenage mothers in Morogoro. (*The Guardian*)

### ***Opposition Coalition faults JPM stance on pregnant schoolgirls***

Shadow Minister for Education, Science and Vocational Training, Suza Lyimo said she has been saddened by the president's statement because all students had a constitutional right to education. She said they have been advocating the matter for several years, and there is already a government document explaining how pregnant girls should be allowed back to school. Zambia and Kenya have approved similar policies, and the Deputy Minister for Education had previously informed the National Assembly that the government was working on guidelines on the matter.

But President Magufuli said that the debate was closed, and the government would never allow young mothers back into school while he is in office. (*The Guardian*)

### ***Teen mothers: what JPM ban portend for girls***

In response to the parliamentary debate about the education of young mothers, the Citizen profiled the story of a young girl who at the age of 8 had gone to Dar es Salaam under the promise of being given an education, but ended up working as a house girl. Her neighbour offered to take care of her, but after several months said he could not take care of her for free, as she was not a relative. He made her pregnant when she was 12, and she enrolled in the MEMKWA programme in 2014, but the article highlights that some officials are even applying Magufuli's ban to MEMKWA classes. (*The Citizen*)

### ***"After getting pregnant you are done" – no more school for Tanzania's mums-to-be***

Civil society organisations are mobilising in response to Magufuli's ban on educating young mothers. A 2013 report from the Centre for Reproductive Rights says that 55,000 pregnant girls have been expelled from school in the last decade. Equality now is supporting a coalition of over 20 organisations who have issued a joint statement against the ban. They cited success from Zanzibar where girls have returned to school without any evidence of an increase in pregnancies as a result of allowing girls back, and called for measures to address violence against girls which is a major cause of teen pregnancy. (*The Guardian, UK*)

### ***Joint statement by coalition of civil society organisations on re-entry to school for girls after they have given birth***

Twaweza published a joint statement from 26 organisations in support of the education of young mothers. The statement cites public opinion from Sauti za Wananchi surveys, showing 71% in favour of pregnant girls returning to school as well as referencing existing government policies which support the education of pregnant girls. The statement also highlights the prevalence of forced sex, quoting research which shows that 3 out of 10 girls are forced in their first sexual experience. (*Twaweza*)

## KEY “ESCROW” SUSPECTS ARRESTED

Two key suspects in the alleged corruption case around power generation contracts – popularly known as the “Escrow” case – have been arrested and charged in Dar es Salaam.

Harbinder Singh Sethi of Pan Africa Power Solutions Tanzania (PAP) and James Rugemalira of VIP Engineering and Marketing jointly face six charges of economic sabotage, forgery, impersonation, running a criminal syndicate, obtaining money by false pretence and causing loss of money to the government. This is the first time that the two, who were at the centre of one of the most high-profile scandals in Tanzania’s recent history, have appeared in court, almost three years after Parliament recommended their prosecution.

Their arrest is seen by many as a strong move by the government to bring to justice suspects implicated in mega scandals. It will also likely boost President John Magufuli’s scorecard on his pledge to combat corruption from the top. Donors and others have previously criticised what they perceived as government inaction on the case, including delaying some aid disbursements.

Mr Sethi and Mr Rugemalira were brought to the court on June 19th, under tight security. Mr Sethi knelt down and Mr Rugemalira squatted before they were led to the dock. They face economic sabotage charges relating to causing the government a loss of over USD \$22m and TSh 309m. The suspects were denied bail.

Government prosecutors told the court that Mr Rugemalira, who owned a 30% stake in IPTL, and Sethi, the executive chairman of PAP, colluded with government officials in running an illegal syndicate with an intention of profiteering from their collusion. The prosecution accused Mr Sethi of forging a company registration certificate in October 2011 and lying that he was a Tanzanian resident living in Masaki area while knowing it was not true. Both the accused were said to have illegally withdrawn large sums of money from the escrow bank account.

Mr Sethi, who mostly lives in South Africa, was reportedly arrested at Julius Nyerere International Airport as he and his wife were about to fly out.

Mr Sethi and Mr Rugemalira were named in 2014 in Parliament as



*Harbinder Singh Sethi and James Rugemalira kneel outside the courtroom*

having overseen a plan which saw more than TSh 300bn transferred from an Escrow account held jointly by IPTL and the Tanzania Electric Supply Company (Tanesco) at the Bank of Tanzania (BoT). According to the investigations of the Tanzanian media, followed up by the National Audit Office and the Public Accounts Committee of Parliament, much of the money was shared around among a long list of high level politicians, government officials, judges and religious leaders, among others. The scandal led to the resignation of the then Attorney General, Fredrick Werema, and Energy and Minerals minister Sospeter Muhongo, while President Jakaya Kikwete fired the then Lands, Housing and Human Settlements Development minister, Prof Anna Tibaijuka. Several other senior government officials in various ministries are facing charges over their role in facilitating the matter or receiving money from the escrow proceeds.

“For a long time now, people have been curious to know the progress of our investigation on the Tegeta escrow and IPTL scandals,” said Valentino Mlowola, Director General of the Prevention and Combatting of Corruption Bureau (PCCB). “I can announce today that the prime suspects ... have been arrested and will be charged with economic sabo-

tage and other related offences.”

“I want to sincerely thank the government for charging the two businessmen over the escrow scandal as recommended by Parliament,” said Mr Zitto Kabwe, the ACT-Wazalendo party leader and Kigoma Urban MP. Mr Kabwe chaired the Public Accounts Committee that investigated the case.

Following the arrests, one of those accused of receiving a portion of the funds, William Ngeleja, the former Minister of Energy and Minerals and the current MP for Segerea (CCM), said he would return to the government the TSh 40.4m he had received from Rugemalira. Ngeleja said he had accepted the money as a “donation” to support constituency development activities and had not at the time realised the money was connected with a scandal.

PCCB public relations officer Musa Misalaba said the bureau has all the details of how the IPTL account funds were disbursed, and will use all its tools of investigation to determine the extent of impropriety, if any. He said the investigations are covering all beneficiaries and others implicated in the scandal, irrespective of whether they are politicians, public servants, religious leaders, or similar, but he declined to disclose the names of the beneficiaries.

Those widely named as having received funds from Rugemalira include Prof Tibaijuka, and Andrew Chenge, former Attorney General and current MP for Bariadi West, who are both reported to have received TSh 1.6bn. Others said to have received smaller amounts include judges, religious leaders, and employees and board members of various public institutions including Tanesco, the tax authority (TRA) and the Tanzania Investment Centre (TIC).

*(The Citizen, The Guardian, Daily News, Mwananchi)*

Ben Taylor:

## VIOLENCE IN KIBITI

There are some signs that the police may have turned a corner in addressing the spate of violence that has afflicted Kibiti and neighbouring districts of Coast Region in recent months.

In February three people, including a police officer, were killed by a

group of bandits at a farm and forestry levies collection centre at Jaribu Mpakani. In April, eight police officers who were deployed there from Morogoro Region to bolster security were ambushed and killed as they were returning to their base from patrol.

In mid-June, a local leader and two villagers in Nyamisati village, Kibiti District, were abducted and shot at by unknown gunmen. Two weeks later, the chairman and executive officer of Mangwi Village were killed in cold blood by armed men, according to sources in the area. The killers also shot and blinded the chairman of a sub-village. And a former CCM ward chairperson was shot dead outside his home in Nyambunda village.

The total number of those killed in the area since 2014 has risen to over 40 people, according to The Citizen newspaper. The list includes local government leaders, local CCM leaders, police officers and civilians.

Home Affairs Minister Mwigulu Nchemba recently informed Parliament in Dodoma of plans to establish a special police zone in Kibiti in a bid to deal with the crisis head on.

The recently-appointed Inspector General of Police, Simon Sirro, cited the restoration of peace and tranquillity in Coast Region as his number one priority, and sought to reassure residents of the affected districts that the violence will soon be brought to an end.

Policing activities in the area have stepped up, and the police claimed significant victories after each of two recent shootouts. In late June, a police patrol car was reportedly ambushed, and in the exchange of fire that followed, four of the six attackers were killed by the police. Then, in early August, the police raided a forest camp, killing 13 suspects in the confrontation.

In a statement, Mr Sirro said the police had arrested one of the suspects, who led them to the camp that the suspects had been using as a hideout. "We made efforts to try and rush them to Muhimbili National Hospital for treatment but they died on the way from the gunshot wounds," he said.

He also said the police recovered some weapons and other items from the camp – including five sub-machine guns, 2 anti-riot guns, a pair of police uniform, one magazine and 153 rounds of ammunition as well

as hand grenades and two motorcycles – adding that investigations showed that the weapons had been used in various criminal incidents, including some of those mentioned above.

Following this, Kibiti District Authorities called upon whose ward and village executives who had fled because of the violence to quickly return to their stations of duty so as to keep serving residents. He said that for now the district's defence and security had been stepped up, so it was

District councillors applauded the efforts of the government and the defence and security services for restoring peace and security in the district.     (*The Citizen, The Guardian, Daily News*)

Ben Taylor:

## CLAMPDOWN ON FAKE ACADEMIC CERTIFICATES

President John Magufuli announced the firing of nearly 10,000 civil servants after receiving a report on public servants' academic certificates. The following day, the full list of those accused of possessing fake certificates was published.

The Minister of State for Public Service Management, Angela Kairuki, noted that from a total of 435,000 civil servants who had their certificates verified, 9,932 were found to possess forged certificates.

The evaluation was commissioned by the President's Office Public Service Management and Good Governance, and conducted by a 15-member team. It was a follow-up exercise after an earlier nationwide crackdown on "ghost workers" that struck 19,706 non-existent employees off the public payroll.

The exercise considered Form IV and VI academic certificates as well as teachers with certificates and diploma qualifications. It did not look at elected representatives or holders of positions directly appointed by the President, such as District Commissioners, as the law does not require such officials to hold academic qualifications beyond the ability to read and write.

Some civil servants were found to possess certificates that did not



match those issued by academic institutions, while others were found to be using certificates issued to other people.

The President ordered all those whose names are in the document to voluntarily leave their jobs within two weeks or otherwise face seven-year jail terms. He also ordered any salary payments for them to be suspended.

Some of those whose names appeared on the “list of shame” have maintained their innocence, claiming possession of genuine credentials. They have said they are considering an appeal against the dossier.

Further, several commentators noted that dismissing such a large number of civil servants at the same time could have a significant negative impact on public services and public administration, particularly as there was already an estimated shortage of around 50,000 public servants in health, education and justice sectors.

“We should expect quite a disruption on social service delivery due to lost expertise and experience,” said Prof Gaudens Mpangala of Ruaha Catholic University.

“It is sad to say but the government has approached the issue of fake certificates in the civil service the same way as the anti-corruption crusade. Selective justice is at play. And the people are right to ask why should some people in the same government be forgiven while others are made accountable,” he said.

Dr Hellen Kijo-Bisimba of the Legal and Human Right Centre said to avoid the disruption of social services and to ensure justice is done to all those concerned President Magufuli should have pardoned all who were found with forged certificates and should focus his attention instead on preventing use of fake certificates among future recruits. “The war on fake certificates should be forward looking. A system should be put in place to ensure no one would be employed if they use forged certificates,” she said.

The Tanganyika Law Society (TLS) said they intend to file a case against the controversial Dar es Salaam Regional Commissioner, Paul Makonda, over alleged use of fake academic certificates. TLS President Tundu Lissu said that claims had been circulating widely that Makonda is using another person’s certificate and his real name is Daudi Bashite.

Ben Taylor:

## CUF'S ONGOING TRAVAILS

The power struggle within the opposition party, the Civic United Front (CUF), shows no signs of letting up, with several dramatic incidents having taken place over the past few months. The dispute pits a predominantly mainland faction of the party aligned with former Presidential candidate, Professor Ibrahim Lipumba, against a Zanzibar-dominated faction aligned with the former Vice President of Zanzibar, Seif Sharif Hamad.

The crisis in CUF began last year after Prof Lipumba, who had resigned as chairman ahead of the 2015 General Election, decided to rescind on his resignation. During an extraordinary national congress that had been called to elect his successor in August, Prof Lipumba dramatically forced his way in to the meeting. That did not prevent delegates voting to confirm his resignation. However, the Registrar of Political Parties, Judge Francis Mutungi, dismissed the decision by the Supreme Governing Council to expel him from the party, in a ruling that gave the professor a major boost in his bid for the CUF chairmanship.

In late April a press conference, arranged by members of the Seif-aligned group in Dar es Salaam, was raided by four masked men wielding weapons, including a pistol. Several people were injured, including journalists and one of the attackers who was arrested when the police arrived. Members of the Lipumba-aligned faction admitted they had sent the people who interrupted the meeting.

In July, Professor Lipumba, empowered by Judge Mutungi's decision, expelled eight of the party's special seats MPs from the party, thus stripping them of their seats in parliament, and appointed eight new MPs to the positions. The changes were upheld by the Speaker, Job Ndugai.

Mr Hamad issued a press statement accusing the office of the Registrar of Political Parties, the Office of the Speaker and the Police of working to weaken the party by backing Prof Lipumba. He said the axed MPs are going to High Court to challenge the decision by Prof Lipumba, and will ask the court to declare them legitimate CUF members and therefore legitimate members of parliament.

Prof Lipumba accused Mr Hamad of abandoning office and his responsibilities.

## David Brewin: FOREIGN RELATIONS

### **Foreign relations and the 'economic war'**

Ever since independence in 1961 Tanzania has enjoyed warm and friendly relations with most countries around the world. The formidable leadership of the first president (Nyerere) and his determined fight against colonialism in Africa kept him constantly in the news but there were many up and downs. Relations were broken off for a period time between Britain and Tanzania over what was then Southern Rhodesia (and later Zimbabwe) over its progress towards independence and his relations with East and West Germany because of their diverging policies.

Friction also arose over the different policies of the Communist governments in Eastern Europe and the capitalist governments in much of the rest of Europe. Nyerere had little enthusiasm for Western capitalism and tried hard to establish good relations with the then communist world. Above all he wanted Tanzania to be self-reliant and pursued this policy through, amongst other things, his forced 'villagisation' programme. He showed no hesitation in nationalising huge swathes of foreign owned enterprises including all the banks usually without payment of compensation.

His actions resulted in the gradual collapse of the sisal industry which had been one of the main elements of the country's exports at that time although other factors played a part in this. A policy on tourism, which, in later years, became a major source of income for the country, was not on his priority list.

However, his great charm and the very warm relations he established with the newly emerging China and the Scandinavian countries have persisted to this day and helped to alleviate the economic situation.

By the end of his term the economy was in crisis while Nyerere concentrated on the hugely time-consuming tasks of liberating the rest of Africa, entering into a Union with revolutionary Zanzibar and on social development, particularly in education, at home. Many considered Tanzania's economy to have become a virtual 'basket case' but the foundations had been laid for a socially more equitable state.

His two successors as president (Mwinyi and Mkapa) concentrated on revival of the economy and foreign capital investment began to flow

again. Mwinyi and Mkapa realised that Europe and America were where the money was and efforts were made to attract some of it to Tanzania. Relations with the West became warmer again.

Then president Magufuli arrived on the scene and began a radical transformation of the economy. He calls it the 'Economic War' The latest developments on this are outlined in other parts of this issue.

The arrival of the spectacularly successful new world in China has made it possible for Tanzania and other developing countries to obtain huge investment without the strict restrictions placed on other foreign direct investment. His policy of putting 'Tanzania First' has some features in common those of President Trump in America and his 'America First' policy.

Thus, Tanzania is entering a period of economic change, the eventual results of which are very difficult to determine as foreign investors wonder what their future might be and whether Tanzania still welcomes such investment.

### **Lake Nyasa/Lake Malawi**

The boundary dispute between Malawi and Tanzania over the ownership of this lake continues. The Malawian government has threatened to escalate the dispute by taking it to the International Court of Justice in The Hague as several attempts to find a resolution have failed.

An issue of particular concern to Malawi is that the lake's geographical space represents about a third of Malawi's total space. Malawi argues that its economic life, culture, folklore and sentiment as a nation are linked to the lake and that therefore much is at stake. Tanzania however points to the large number of Tanzanian fishermen and their ancestral burial places in the Lake.

Malawi and Tanzania both have a common interest in the form of a massive reservoir of the most valuable natural resource – fresh water. There is talk also of hydrocarbon deposits but at the very least, the lake is filled with fish.

*A longer version of this article appeared first in 'The Conversation' by Gbenga Oduntan, Associate Professor in International Commercial Law at the University of Kent, UK – Editor.*

## **Zambia and Kenya**

When, in mid-August, Zambia agreed to supply Kenya with 100,000 tons of maize, to relieve its serious shortages, plans were made to supply it by road. But Tanzania said no. It could not agree to these large loads passing over Tanzanian roads. However, before the dispute could become more serious, it was agreed between Zambia and Tanzania to provide a special lane on their TAZARA railway line. These commodities were to be shipped by rail to Dar es Salaam and then on to Mombasa by sea. Zambia also agreed to cut the time spent in the issuing of permits to 24 hours rather than the normal seven days. Zambia and Kenya also agreed reduce the trade turn-around time.

## **Congo**

President Joseph Kabila of the Democratic Republic of Congo paid a three-day state visit to Tanzania in September with the emphasis on improving trade links with Tanzania. The two governments signed a Memorandum of Understanding to conduct joint oil exploration on Lake Tanganyika. The leaders agreed that they would fast-track the construction of the standard gauge railway linking Congo with the Dar es Salaam port. Tanzania said it would allocate dedicated inland container terminals at Ruvu for cargo destined to go to Congo.

President Magufuli said that the two countries had cemented their trade, security and economic ties. President Kabila said that it was the first time since he became president that he had visited Tanzania to discuss trade. All his previous visits had concentrated on security. President Magufuli said that traffic through the Dar port was growing at the rate of 10.6% annually and that trade volumes between the two countries had increased from TSh 23 million in 2009 to TSh 396 million in 2016.

Some observers questioned the timing of this state visit as President Kabila was originally persuaded to step down as president in December 2016 at the end of his constitutionally mandated two-term limit in a deal mediated by the Catholic Church. There was a clear commitment to hold elections by the end of 2017 and that President Kabila would not be a candidate or try to amend the constitution. But these commitments seem to have been largely ignored and it is not known what the future holds.

**Mauritius**

Tanzania and Mauritius have committed themselves to promoting themselves jointly as twin tourist destinations. Mauritius national carrier Air Mauritius launched flights to Tanzania two years ago. The two countries have also signed special contracts with three consulting agencies from Europe and America to develop a marketing strategy for Germany, the USA and UK designed to penetrate world tourist markets. Mauritius recorded 2 million tourist arrivals in 2016 while Tanzania received 1.1 million. Tanzania is also targeting European travel markets, plus China, Russia, Turkey, Brazil and the Gulf states and promises more aggressive tourism marketing in the future.

**‘Feza schools’ and Turkey**

After the violent failed coup d’état aimed at removing Turkish President Erdogan in late 2016 a massive purge began against anyone suspected of having been involved. Tanzania, which has warm relations with Turkey, has been the subject of allegations of involvement by 10 Feza schools which have been established in Tanzania. Turkey has targeted businesses associated with a Muslim cleric involved with these schools and has accused them of funding terrorist activities. Turkey’s ambassador to Tanzania has called for deregistration of the 10 schools as well as other businesses alleged to be funding the opposition against the Turkish president. However, Tanzania’s Foreign Minister Augustine Mahiga has explained that the 10 schools in Tanzania, which are run under the Ishik Medical and Educational Foundation, like other businesses in the country, had been vetted before being registered to operate in the country.

## Ben Taylor: **BUSINESS & THE ECONOMY**

**National budget endorsed**

MEMBERS of Parliament (MPs) overwhelmingly endorsed the 2017/18 national budget: of 355 votes cast, 260 voted to approve the budget and 95 voted against. All but two opposition legislators voted to oppose the budget.

Finance and Planning Minister Philip Mpango announced the abolition of Value Added Tax (VAT) on hunting fees, licences and permits in order to promote business in the sector. He also relieved private schools of skills development levy and fire extinguishing fees, expressing the hope that school owners will reduce their fees and enable more Tanzanian children to access private education. Further, industrial investors will no longer have to pay for the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) fee, said the Minister.

“The property tax is charged on permanent structures in cities, municipalities, towns and townships...villages and mud houses will not be taxed,” he clarified, adding that houses for people aged over 60 years are also exempted.

During the debate, a proposed property tax of TSh 10,000 and TSh 50,000 per ordinary house and storied buildings, respectively, were decried, with legislators describing the taxing of rural mud-built and grass-thatched houses as unfair and unjustifiable. The Minister clarified that “the property tax is charged on permanent structures in cities, municipalities, towns and townships ... mud houses and houses in villages will not be taxed.” He added that houses for people aged over 60 years are also exempted.

Dr Mpango also defended the replacement of the annual motor vehicle licence fee with a levy of TSh 40 per litre on fuel, saying the move will relieve motorists with the burden of fee, which is costly. He dismissed claims by many MPs that taxing fuel was burdening the poor for the benefit of motorists, mostly urban dwellers, saying the collected taxes will be used to finance development projects and social service provision for the benefit of all, rural dwellers inclusive.

Deputy Minister for Finance, Dr Ashatu Kijaji said the government was committed to fulfilling President John Magufuli’s campaign promise to disburse TSh 50m to each village, saying already the State has already allocated about TSh 120bn for the purpose.

“We remain committed to release this money but there are issues that must be tackled...we are currently working on firm systems to support the distribution of the money,” said Dr Kijaji.

The Minister of State in the President’s Office, Public Service Management

and Good Governance, Angela Kairuki said she would permanently verify the authenticity of public servants to ensure that not a penny from government coffers will be paid without proper justification.

“Let me be referred to as minister of verification, if necessary,” said the Minister, declaring the introduction of performance contract system for all executives in the public sector.

The opposition camp in parliament took issue with the budget, saying it contained serious, unexplained discrepancies and that it was crafted on the basis of an ambitious but unrealistic revenue assumptions. The Shadow Finance and Planning Minister, Ms Halima Mdee, is unable to attend sessions in parliament until February 2018 following a ban issued by the speaker. Her response to the budget was therefore issued to journalists.

Miss Mdee said the presented budget seems to be bent on killing the Decentralisation by Devolution (D by D) plan which seeks devolve powers from the central to the local government authorities. D by D started out of the admission that the central government had failed to do everything. Unfortunately, the central government is now grabbing the powers of collecting property tax and city service levy away from local government authorities,” said Ms Mdee.

Earlier, when tabling the budget, Mr Mpango acknowledged the concern of the increasing frequency of businesses closure in Kariakoo, Dar es Salaam and in other cities. He said figures from the tax authority, TRA, showed that from July 2016 to March 2017, a total of 7,277 businesses were shut down. “This trend is discouraging since residents lose jobs and incomes and the government loses tax revenue, while the economy slows down,” he said.

He told parliament that factors contributing to business shutdown include stiff business competition, weak business management, increasing business operating costs attributed to transportation, taxes and levies; and non-compliance to business rules and principles. He also reminded the house that it is worth noting that business owners have become aware of the need to report to TRA as soon as they cease their business operations in order to avoid accumulation of tax liabilities, and that a much larger of new businesses were registered during the same period.



He compared this situation to that of China since the 1980's, quoting from a book on the subject: "Businesses at the time were like ships, each raised up and carried along by the sheer momentum of the wave. Some, however, soon capsized and were swallowed up, while most drifted along, going with the flow. Others crashed against barriers in the sea or got stranded on deserted islands. Only a few rose atop the crest of the wave and survived, eventually sailed towards new lands."

The Minister refuted accusations that the government was anti-business, reassuring business leaders that the fifth phase government recognised business as the engine of the economy and recognised the contribution of business to national development. He pointed to the government's efforts to maintain economic stability, peace and security, reduce regulation and to develop national infrastructure as evidence of the government's pro-business credentials. He also reminded TRA officials to act fairly and in accordance with the law when dealing with tax payers. (*The Citizen, Daily News*)

### **Case against Manji heard at Muhimbili National Hospital**

Kisutu Magistrate's Court in Dar es Salaam briefly relocated to Muhimbili National Hospital (MNH) in July, where prominent businessman Yusuph Manji and three others were charged with seven counts relating to military uniform fabrics worth over TSh 200m. Other charges relate to illegal possession of government stamps, which are three rubber stamps of the TPDF bearing different addresses and two motor vehicle plate numbers of government offices suspected to have been unlawfully acquired. Manji is charged alongside three officials with Quality Group, the firm he heads.

Manji has for several months been a patient of the Jakaya Kikwete Cardiac Institute under police supervision after initially being arrested on immigration-related charges.

It is alleged that on June 30, the accused persons were found by a police officer in possession the fabric, stamps and number-plates without lawful authority. The prosecution alleges that this was prejudicial to the safety or interests of the United Republic of Tanzania.

Manji and his co-accused were not required to enter a plea at this stage. (*Daily News, The Citizen*)

**The armyworm returns in another form**

The much-feared armyworm caterpillars have returned in another form to parts of Africa including Tanzania. These armyworms are called “fall



*The Fall Armyworm (Spodoptera frugiperda)*

armyworm”, and they began emerging in early 2017 throughout East Africa and beyond. During recent months, the governments of Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania have allocated more than \$7.85 million for the purchase of specialised chemicals to fight them as they could wipe out large areas particularly of maize and sugarcane.

The fall armyworm is not easily noticeable in its early stages as it attacks from the heart of the maize or sugar plant. It burrows into the stalks of maize like a borer and once the worms turn into moths they can lay more than 2000 eggs in different places with a lifespan of 30 days spreading fast and in huge numbers.

The Permanent Secretary in the Tanzanian Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries Mathew Mtigumwe has been quoted in the press as saying that the government is aware of the presence of the new species and has put into action various initiatives to control the situation particularly in the Katavi, Mbeya and Songwe areas. Rungwe Region has been attacked from neighbouring Zambia.

The fall armyworm appears to be new in Africa and it attacks maize at all stages. Control is difficult because of the cost and scarcity of specialised pesticides as the crops are resistant to the conventional chemicals formerly used against armyworm.

### **Expansion of irrigation**

Tanzania is said to be still well below achieving its target of 1 million hectares of irrigated land, as efforts to boost irrigation in Tanzania continue but the industry faces many problems. These include ongoing low productivity, rising food prices, and growing concerns that climate change will impact on Africa's already unpredictable weather.

The total area of irrigated land in Tanzania is expected to double between 2004 and 2040 which promises big increases in food security. Crop yields are estimated to be 2 to 4 times higher on irrigated land than on non-irrigated land.

Tanzania may actually be much closer than expected to its national target of 1 million hectares of land irrigated, but the figures are difficult to confirm because official statistics often do not include irrigation schemes set up and run by individual small farmers. Further research is needed.

### **Cashew nut smuggling**

Prime Minister Kassim Majaliwa has warned that traders and farmers in Lindi Region must stop selling cashew nuts to "racketeers", and told them that they must use the official authorised marketing channels which will also provide better prices. Some traders have been buying the nuts at TSh 1,000 per kilo but the real price is expected to rise to TSh 3,500 this year.

## **Enos Bukuku: CONSTITUTION**

### **"The People's Opinion"**

I had hoped to be able to write about developments in the constitution making process, which has stalled for approximately two years. In early April, the Minister of Constitution and Legal Affairs, Prof Palamagamba Kabudi, declared that the process would resume. Since then, however, there have not been any statements from him or President Magufuli as to when this important issue will be put back on the political agenda.

CCM Publicity Secretary, Humphrey Polepole, who was a member of the Constitutional Review Committee (CRC) which prepared the first draft constitution (known as the "Warioba draft"), has expressed his

desire that the process should revert to Warioba draft, and therefore scrap the final draft constitution which caused such deep and irreconcilable divisions amongst those involved in the process. He calls the Warioba draft “the People’s Opinion”. The final version, “the proposed constitution”, was created by the Constituent Assembly (CA), which comprised a vast majority of CCM politicians, and made substantial changes to the Warioba draft, many of which are seen to be unpopular. By implication, the final draft may well be considered “CCM’s opinion”, or perhaps the opinion of the previous CCM government.

The legal process for the formation of a new constitution, which outlines very clear timescales and procedures, does not provide for the CA’s work to be ignored. The next step, according to the legal requirements, is for the final draft constitution to be put to a national referendum for whether it should be approved. If Mr Polepole’s wish is to be granted, then there will need to be a change in the legal procedures, which will not be a quick process.

Certainly, the nation is eager to hear Prof Kabudi’s plans. There is no expectation that we will have a new constitution any time soon. For this to change, the President must be the one to initiate the momentum.

At a time when many are complaining that the fundamental freedoms and rights of individuals are being trodden on, this is when a robust and reliable constitution is needed. There have been various human rights interest groups who have voiced their concerns over the way in which the government is exercising its power. This is supposed to be the people’s constitution - so the people, not just politicians, need to speak up (if they feel they are able to). The likely alternative is the *status quo*.

Ben Taylor:

## HEALTH

### **Concern over rising diabetes burden**

Experts on non-communicable diseases (NCDs) have predicted that the cost of curbing diabetes in Tanzania and other eastern African countries will increase from \$3.8 billion in 2015 to \$16.2 billion by 2030. The Lancet Diabetes and Endocrinology Commission on Diabetes in sub-Saharan Africa, say the cost associated with the disease could more than double in sub-Saharan Africa by 2030, with Tanzania, Kenya and

Ethiopia especially hard-hit. They say that this is likely to happen if type 2 diabetes cases continue to increase.

“We conclude that sub-Saharan Africa is not prepared for the increasing burden of diabetes brought about by rapid and ongoing transitions,” said the commission’s report. “Effective management of diabetes in sub-Saharan Africa will require careful considerations about the expansion of services to meet current and future burden, while ensuring that services are integrated with those for other chronic diseases. The health, economic, and societal consequences of inaction will be huge. Decisive action is needed now, by all stakeholders, to address the scale and urgency of diabetes in sub-Saharan Africa.”

The report estimates that the economic cost of diabetes in sub-Saharan Africa in 2015 totalled \$19.5 billion, equivalent to 1.2% of the region’s GDP. More than half of this economic cost is spent on accessing diabetes treatment, including medication and hospital stays. The remaining economic costs were a result of productivity losses, mostly from early death, as well as people leaving the workforce early, taking sick leave and being less productive at work due to poor health.

Rapid societal transitions that are producing increases in wealth, urbanisation, changing lifestyle and eating habits, more sedentary work practices and aging populations have led to increased risk of type 2 diabetes. (*The Citizen*)

### **Tanzania moves to put all people living with HIV on ARVs**

TANZANIA officially started anti-retroviral (ARV) treatment for people living with HIV after testing positive effective October last year, with the government announcing that the new arrangement targets 1.2 million victims. The move comes in the wake of a World Health Organisation (WHO) directive in 2015 that any HIV-positive person must immediately be put on anti-retroviral treatment regardless of CD4 count.

The WHO directive followed studies that established that it was safer for patients to start using the drugs before the CD4 count dropped. Previously, Tanzania was applying a system under which only patients whose CD4 cell count had dropped to below 350 qualified for the therapy.

The Deputy Minister for Health, Community Development, Gender,

Elderly and Children, Dr Hamisi Kigwangalla, told Parliament that between July 2015 and June 2016, about 84,000 people who had tested HIV positive were enrolled for ARVs treatment.

“We will ensure that whoever is found with HIV, including children and elders, start taking the drugs straightway,” said the deputy minister.

The government also plans to include a new generic version of the anti-retroviral drug Dolutegravir (DTG) in the national HIV/Aids treatment protocols. The Minister of Health, Community Development, Gender, Elderly and Children, Ms Ummu Mwalimu, told The Citizen that the ARV had been lined up for registration and licensing by the Tanzania Food and Drugs Authority (TFDA). A generic of DTG, first approved in the United States in 2013, is already in use in Kenya and has the backing of Unitai, the global health initiative working to end tuberculosis, HIV/Aids and malaria epidemics.

“Shipments are scheduled to start in January 2018 after the TFDA’s registration process is completed,” said the Minister. She added that Tanzania would start using the generic drug in combination with other ARVs. DTG, whose brand name is Tivicay, is produced by ViiV Healthcare, which is majority-owned by British pharmaceutical giant GlaxoSmithKline.

A total of 1.4 million Tanzanians were estimated to be living with HIV in 2015. An estimated 54,000 new infections and 36,000 AIDS-related deaths occur in Tanzania each year. (*Daily News, The Citizen*)

### **Government reiterates respect for traditional healers**

The Minister for Health, Community Development, Gender, Elders and Children, Ummu Mwalimu, told parliament that traditional healers are legally recognised by the government through the Traditional and Alternative Health Practice Council, 2002. She said that the government has set-up a new registration system for herbalist and traditional healers, where they are supposed to register at their specific localities under the office of the District Medical Officers (DMOs).

The minister was responding to questions from MPs. Joseph Kasheku, Geita Rural MP, expressed concern with the level of education of some of the practising herbalists in the country, and called on the government to come up with an educational plan for traditional healers, especially

since many Tanzanians depend on their services. Ushetu MP, Elias Kwandikwa, wanted to know why the government was arresting traditional healers in Ushetu District.

In 1974, the Traditional Medicine Research Unit was established at the University of Dar es Salaam, and in 1989 the government set up a Traditional Health Services Unit in order to unify traditional health practitioners and mobilise them to form their own association.

Traditional health services were officially recognised in the National Health Policy of 1990, and in 2002 the Traditional and Alternative Medicines Act was introduced. (*Daily News*)

Ben Taylor:

## TRANSPORT

### **Dar port expansion underway**

In July, President John Magufuli laid the foundation stone to launch construction works at Dar es Salaam port to deepen and upgrade seven of the port's berths.

Dr Magufuli was informed that at present, only ships up to 243m in length and with carrying capacity of between 2,500 and 4,000 twenty-foot equivalent units (TEUs) can dock, but that following the upgrading works, the port will accommodate Post Panamax ships with 320-metre lengths and carrying capacity of up to 8,000 TEUs.

The Dar es Salaam Maritime Gateway Project (DMGP) is supported by the World Bank, which has offered a USD \$345m loan, and the United Kingdom through the Department for International Development (DfID) through a USD \$12.4m grant. The Tanzanian government, through own sources, will provide USD \$63.4m.

The upgrading of the country's major port is expected to enable more ships to dock, offload and load shipments at the harbour at the same time, reducing dwell time and enhancing efficiency. Dwell time at the port is expected to drop from 80 to 30 hours.

President Magufuli was impressed by the project and instructed the contractor, China Harbour Engineering Company (CHEC), to fast-track the project from 36 to between 28 and 30 months.

"This project will benefit not only Tanzania but her landlocked neigh-



*Launch of Dar es Salaam Maritime Gateway Project (DSMGP) (World Bank)*

bours like Rwanda, Zambia, Burundi, Uganda, Malawi and Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC). The envisaged Standard Gauge Railway (SGR) will highly depend on the effectiveness of the port that handles 90 per cent of imported goods,” he said.

The entrance channel will have its depth deepened from 10.2m to 15.5m for a distance of 8km and its width widened from 140m to 170m, explained the Director General of Tanzania Ports Authority (TPA), Eng Deusededit Kakoko. *(Daily News)*

### **Dar es Salaam wins Sustainable Transport Award**

Dar es Salaam was announced the winner of the Sustainable Transport Award by the Institute for Transport Development and Policy (ITDP) in New York. This makes Dar the first African city to win the prestigious award.

ITDP notes that Dar had “launched a series of transformative improvements to transit, cycling and walking” in the past year, the most important of which is the Dar es Salaam Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system, or DART. “DART is a high-quality, high-capacity BRT system incorporating best practice design and features, is the first true BRT system in East Africa. It spans 21 km of trunk route, and serves 160,000 passengers per day on average with the current fleet of 140 buses. By mid-2018, when the first phase becomes fully operational with over 300 buses, the



system is projected to carry an estimated 400,000 passengers per day. DART has reduced commute times by more than half for residents.”

“Serving the key axis of Morogoro Road and running through the city centre, DART is more than a public transit system, it has brought improvements for pedestrians and cyclists as well. The project includes cycle paths, sidewalks, and improved pedestrian safety with well-designed, at-grade pedestrian crossings also complying with universal accessibility principles.” (*The Guardian*)

### **Eleven locomotives abandoned**

The government has ordered Tanzania Railway Limited (TRL) and Tanzania Ports Authority (TPA) to explain the circumstances that led to the abandoning of eleven locomotives at the Dar es Salaam port.

The deputy minister of Works, Transport and Communications, Edwin Ngonyani ordered a report in July, a day after President John Magufuli had hinted at “dirty games” in the procurement process of the locomotives that arrived at the port a week earlier.

TPA director general Mr Deusdedit Kakoko told reporters that the locomotives belonged to TRL. It seems, however, that TRL had a dispute with the suppliers of the locomotives that TPA was not aware of at the time of clearing the consignment, according to Mr Kakoko.

The Citizen newspaper reported that the locomotives were dispatched in fulfilment of the contract signed in 2013 between TRL and a US based firm, Electro-Motive Diesel (EMD). A statement issued by the then TRL director general, Mr Kipallo Kisamfu said TSh70.9 billion had been paid to the contractor on 13 locomotives which would be dispatched in three phases. (*The Citizen*)

### **St Lucky Vincent school bus tragedy**

Thirty-five people died when a bus carrying pupils from St Lucky Vincent School in Arusha crashed into a gorge in Karatu District in May. Among the dead were two teachers and a driver, and thirty-two pupils. They were travelling to Karatu to take part in mock examinations.

Vice President Samia Suluhu led mourners at a communal mass.

Three survivors were taken to the US for treatment, and have made good progress. They are expected to return to Tanzanian sometime in August. (*Daily News, The Citizen, The Guardian*)

Donovan McGrath:

## TANZANIA IN THE INTERNATIONAL MEDIA

### **African Billionaires: 30 under 30** (*Forbes Woman/Forbes Life*)

Jokate Mwegelo is one of the 30 under 30 class of 2017 in the June edition of *Forbes Africa USA*). A millennial who made her mark as a beauty queen, musician and actress in under a year and convinced Africa's youngest billionaire to invest in her start-up company. Extract continues: Jokate Mwegelo has more followers than AKA and Bonang Matheba put together. She inspires girls from Angola to Zimbabwe without even trying. For an entrepreneur in a Tanzanian town, she has a celeb-style media following... It's been a long road to here for 30-year-old Mwegelo. Her journey began in 2006 when taking a gap year after high school. To pass time, Mwegelo volunteered for the United Nations and entered the Miss Tanzania contest... She wasn't crowned queen, but left an impression, which ushered in opportunities for acting; her debut was a role in a movie called *Fake Pastors*. The movie's success was genuine. "This was a time when the movie industry was becoming more commercialized in Tanzania..." ... It paved the way for more roles and earned her two awards in the Zanzibar International Film Festival and a stint as a musician collaborating with the likes of Nigerian multiple award-winning hip-hop star Ice Prince... "My parents were very strict and valued education..." ... She graduated in Political Science and Philosophy at the University of Dar es Salaam... "As a former beauty queen, actress, media personality and fashion enthusiast, I felt I could do so much more with my image and for the industry... I felt like we needed a female billionaire..." ... Five years ago, Mwegelo used her savings to found Kidoti Company, a lifestyle brand... She started designing clothes for popular artists, and then received a soft loan from Africa's youngest billionaire, Tanzanian Mohamed Dewji. It changed everything... Kidoti designs and manufactures synthetic hair extensions, sandals and bags... [T]hey partnered with China's Rainbow Shell Craft... The company promises to be a big success for Mwegelo, it doesn't end here. She says giving back is a key part of her life. She launched 'Be Kidotified', a campaign which empowers young girls ... She also launched 'Msusi Wao' translated 'their hairstylist', which connects hair dressers, financiers and customers. Africa certainly needs more female billionaires... (3 July 2017)

## Everton's Invasion in Tanzania

**Echo News (UK)** online: The Scouse invasion of Tanzania has begun... Koeman, Rooney and co flew direct on a special charter from Liverpool... Some went via Dubai, others through Oman and Qatar. The more creative opted for a night or two in Zanzibar before heading for Dar es Salaam ... *Everton players Idrissa Gueye and Leighton Baines, amongst others, visited Uhuru Primary School in Dar es Salaam.* Extract continues: For the locals, though, there is no doubt who the main attraction [was], Rooney. ... Keane, Tom Davies and Mo Besic headed off to meet members of Albino United Football Club, while Klaasen, Matty Pennington, Phil Jagielka and Dominic Calvert-Lewin embarked on a Tanzanian cooking challenge at the team hotel. The five-hour connecting flight from Dubai was routine enough, but what awaited fans at Julius Nyerere International Airport was anything but. A convoluted visa process led to lengthy, sweaty and frustrating delays crammed inside a tiny arrivals hall... [T]he delay meant fans were denied the chance to watch Rooney and co in action at Everton's open training session at Tanzania's National Stadium... In any case, they'd arrived, and could now take in a bit of Dar es Salaam... An ordeal at times, yes, but whatever else Everton's historic African trip throws up, it's already an experience! (12 July 2017)

## Barrick Gold, Tanzania begin talks to resolve Acacia Mining dispute

*Mining.com (Canada)*: To say Acacia Mining ... is having a rough time in Tanzania is to underestimate the challenges the company, one of the largest gold producers in Africa, has been facing ... The miner, Tanzania's No.1 gold producer, is in the midst of a bitter dispute with the East African's country's government, which - among other things - has accused Acacia of tax evasion and illegal operations, served the firm with a \$190-billion bill in fines and allegedly outstanding taxes, questioned staff and even blocked one of the firm's senior executives ... from leaving the country. "World's largest gold miner Barrick hopes to reach an agreement over both the claims against its subsidiary and the current ban on mineral concentrate exports" (see TA117)... The Canadian gold miner said ... it had formally begun talks [with] high-rank Tanzania's government officials ... Barrick's chairman John Thornton and President John Magufuli met in June in Dar es Salaam ... The stock, however, has lost more than 67% of its value since the export ban came in effect in

March this year. The situation is so delicate that the miner warned ... it would have to close its flagship Bulyanhulu mine by Sept. 30 if the prohibition is not lifted (31 July 2017).

### **Tanzania ‘witch killings’ claimed 479 lives from January - June 2017: report**

*Africanews.com (South Africa)*: Five women accused of being witches and murdered by a mob ... were among some 80 people killed each month in Tanzania this year by vigilantes taking the law into their own hands ... Thousands of elderly Tanzanian women have been strangled, knifed to death and burned alive over the last two decades after being denounced as witches. The report published by the Dar es Salaam-based rights group Legal and Human Rights Centre showed 479 deaths related to mob justice reported in Tanzania from January to June this year, including women accused of witchcraft. While 117 deaths have been reported to have occurred in Dar (this year), Mbeya sits second with 33 people lynched followed by Mara with 28 and Geita with 26 deaths... Belief in witchcraft in the East African country dates back centuries as a way of explaining common misfortunes like death, failed harvests and infertility... The report comes a week after police in the western Tabora region launched a hunt for the suspected killers of five women in Undomo village. The women were accused of being witches, beaten to death and their bodies burned, police said (1 August 2017).

### **Tanzania president under fire for urging refugees to return to ‘stable’ Burundi**

*The Guardian UK (online)*: Tanzania’s president, John Magufuli, has drawn fierce criticism from activists after urging thousands of Burundian refugees to return to their home country. Magufuli has ordered the suspension of the registration and naturalisation of thousands of Burundian refugees, and told home affairs minister, Mwigulu Nchemba, to stop granting them citizenship. “It’s not that I am expelling Burundian refugees. I am just advising them to voluntarily return home,” said Magufuli. “I urge Burundians to remain in their country, I have been assured, the place is now calm.”... But Joseph Siegle, director at the Africa Centre for Strategic Studies in Washington, said Magufuli’s comments were “at odds with the situation on the ground, as all available reports on Burundi by the East African Community, African Union and UN demonstrate that the situation is getting worse and refugee

numbers are increasing". Siegle is among a number of regional experts who have attacked Magufuli, pointing out that the situation in Burundi remains dangerous... Magufuli's order came shortly after he held talks with Pierre Nkurunziza, his Burundian counterpart, at the border town of Ngara on 20 July. Tanzania hosts 241,687 Burundian refugees and asylum seekers [hosting] "... more Burundian refugees than any other country." ... "Tanzania has an ongoing obligation under international refugee law to ensure that Burundians fleeing violence and persecution can remain in Tanzania," said Maria Burnett, associate director at Human Rights Watch... (29 July 2017)

### **School bus crashes in Tanzania killing dozens**

*The Guardian (UK) online:* A school bus has crashed in Tanzania killing 32 schoolchildren, two teachers and the driver after it plunged into a roadside ravine in the northern tourist region of Arusha, a senior police official has said. "The accident happened when the bus was descending on a steep hill in rainy conditions," regional commander Charles Mkumbo said. "We are still investigating the incident to determine if it was caused by a mechanical defect or human error on the part of the driver." The pupils killed in the accident, which occurred at about 9.30am in Karatu district, were aged 12 to 13, and from the Lucky Vincent primary school on their way to visit another school, Mkumbo said. Tanzania's president, John Magufuli, described the accident as a national tragedy in statement. Tanzania, the second-largest economy in east Africa, has a poor road safety network but buses remain the main form of public transport between towns. More than 11,000 people were killed in road accidents in Tanzania between 2014 and 2016, according to government data. (6 May 2017)

### **Cancer rates are soaring in Africa, yet Tanzania's radiotherapy hub stands idle**

*The Guardian (UK) online:* A state-of-the-art oncology clinic lacks the funding and staff to get its equipment up and running, despite thousands of people requiring life-saving treatment. The white bulk of the cobalt-60 radiotherapy machine is just visible inside the dark cement bunker. The electricity in the room at Bugando Medical Centre is shut off. The machine, donated last year by the Indian government, looks ready to go, but it has yet to deliver a life-saving dose of radiation. Medical staff at Bugando, a tertiary care and teaching hospital in

Tanzania's second largest city, Mwanza, are keen to start offering radiotherapy to the growing number of cancer patients arriving at the hospital's doors... But getting the expensive technology up and running has been a long struggle... The World Health Organisation warned recently that non-communicable diseases are likely to kill more people in Africa than infectious disease by 2030, and Bugando is on the frontline of this fight... (20 March 2017)

### **Tanzania to lose \$553 million annually if Acacia exits its market**

*The East African (Kenya) online:* ... In the report on Acacia's economic and tax contribution to Tanzania, the mining company's total direct, indirect and induced economic contribution in Tanzania last year included more than 36,000 jobs, about \$339 million of labour income, and nearly \$214 million in tax payments. "In total ... Acacia's total tax contribution last year was an estimated \$214 million," the analysis shows. The total workforce was 3,000, whose wages and benefits totalled over \$101 million, with an average of \$34,000 per employee. "About 2,800 were Tanzanian nationals who received an average annual wage of \$20,000, up from \$17,000 in 2015. The average annual wage for its Tanzanian workers in 2016 was over 10 times higher than the average earnings of \$1,878 for other Tanzanian workers throughout the economy in 2016," the report states... (1 August 2017)

### **John Magufuli: Tanzania's rising star**

*New African (UK/France) online:* This edition featured a profile of Tanzania's current president under the subheadings: "The Magufuli magic", "An unlikely candidate", "The bulldozer swings his scythe", "The backlash" and "Magufuli balance sheet". Extract: In the 1970s, responding to taunts from socialists Tanzanians that neighbouring, capitalist Kenya was a 'dog eat dog' society, the Kenyans came back with 'Tanzania is a man eat nothing society!' They were not far wrong. Tanzania's nationalised industries and collectivised farms failed miserably to meet demand and led to empty shops as shortages of virtually all products, including essentials, began to bite. This has become a dim and distant memory in the country today. The shops are overflowing, prices are some of the lowest in the East African region and there is a sense of optimism and wellbeing. The transformation has been brought about by successive presidents who succeeded the iconic Julius Nyerere... Each leader has stepped in at particular tipping points and

by force of personality and style, moved the country along a notch or two... The big question now was what sort of leader Magufuli would make... The answer was not long in coming. Right from the word go, he not only set out to make good his elections pledges, he went further - to the delight of the masses, but growing concern among the establishment. He did the unthinkable - he cancelled Independence Day celebrations and all the extravagant expenses government traditionally splurged out. Instead, he wanted the day spent on street cleaning and enthusiastically participated, emulating Rwanda's President Kagame. He slashed the budget for the usually opulent opening of parliament by almost 90% and demanded that the money saved be spent on purchasing hospital beds and on road works. He cancelled foreign travel for government officials and put a stop to the purchase of first-class tickets. He decreed henceforth, government meetings would be held in state buildings rather than in expensive hotels. He trimmed down the delegation of 50 set to tour Commonwealth countries to just four. He publicly warned those selected as ministers and other government functionaries that he would not tolerate corruption, laziness or excessive bureaucracy. He told them they should expect nothing more than to work tirelessly to serve the people of the country alongside him. He made it very clear that the gravy train had come to an end. Government posting no longer meant a life of ease, privilege and the opportunity to make money... He made surprise raids at government offices to see for himself who was at their desks, who was absent and who used the well-worn trick of leaving their jackets on the chairs to indicate that they had just stepped out for a moment when in fact they may have been gone for weeks... [O]peration 'squeezing the boil' as they dubbed it ... While he was busy 'squeezing the boil' of incompetence and corruption, Magufuli and his team also rooted out over 10,000 'ghost workers' from various government departments. A nationwide fraud audit had discovered that \$2m a month was going to pay the non-existent workers. The swinging blade did not stop there... The public servants found to have fake certificates were ordered to resign voluntarily or else they would face prosecution for the crime, which is punishable for up to seven years in jail... Despite the president's popularity with the masses ... his blunt leadership style, sometimes controversial statements and impromptu decisions ... have been criticised, mostly by the opposition and also, increasingly by the lay public... In this context, he came under

fire for failing to travel to the northern town of Kagera where 11 people had died and 192 injured following an earthquake. His response to the afflicted, who said that as a result of drought they had nothing to eat, shocked many. He asked them if they expected him to cook food for them. The National Muslim Council of Tanzania (Bakwata) has accused him of deliberately kicking out Muslims from senior government positions ... Despite such sentiments, President Magufuli remains hugely popular. Policies such as free secondary education, free health care for elderly people, tax collection reforms and giving the war on drugs serious attention have all made him popular, especially among the ordinary people who live in rural areas, who see him as their saviour... A senior diplomat in Tanzania says that the majority of civil servants now show up for work, while in the past, many were busy attending seminars, and rarely had time to stay in office and do the work... The opposition have described President Magufuli as 'a dictator' ... [H]is critics say that Magufuli has personally threatened media owners of newspapers critical of his presidency at public rallies and over 10 people have been charged for criticising him on social media since he became president. John Pombe Magufuli 's supporters and critics both agree on one thing. Everything this president has done has been unprecedented in the history of Tanzania... (8 June 2017)

Ben Taylor:

## OBITUARIES



After a period of deteriorating health **Ambassador Clement George Kahama**, popularly known as "Sir George", died in Dar es Salaam on 12 March 2017, aged 88. His long political career – first in local government and then at the national and international levels, and covering both the colonial and independence eras – spanned more than half a century. He was the longest serving Minister in Tanzania's history, holding a wide range of portfolios.

Born in November 1929 in Karagwe (Kagera Region), Sir George was educated at the Ihungu Secondary School and then the Tabora Government Boys Upper Secondary School, prior to undertaking his



higher education at Loughborough College in UK between 1952 and 1954. He then returned to Tanganyika to become the First General Manager of the Bukoba Native Cooperative Union Ltd (responsible for the purchase, processing and marketing of coffee, tea and other agricultural commodities) and also to serve concurrently as Chairman of Bukoba District Council.

In 1957, he became a Nominated Member of the Tanganyika Legislative Council (LEGCO), representing the then West Lake province (now Kagera Region) and from 1958 was an elected MP for that Region. In the two years leading up to Independence he served as Minister for Social and Co-Operative Development in the transitional government.

In the three years immediately following Independence on 9 December 1961, Sir George served first as Minister for Home Affairs and then as Minister for Commerce and Industry, Communications, Transport and Works. He then began the first of three career stints overseas, serving in 1965 and 1966 as Tanzania's Ambassador to the Federal Republic of Germany and to the European Economic Community.

He returned to Dar es Salaam to become for the next seven years the General Manager and CEO of the National Development Corporation, the largest holding company in Tanzania. It was the period immediately after the Arusha Declaration and, during his stewardship, 89 industrial, agricultural, mining and commercial parastatal enterprises were established (some of them as joint ventures with transnational corporations).

Then for the ten years after 1973 George Kahama had responsibility for the planning, development and building of the new national capital, Dodoma. He discharged these responsibilities concurrently as both Minister of State in the President's Office and as Director-General of the Capital Development Authority. They were challenging times but today Tanzania's functioning new capital city stands as a testament to Sir George's determination to realise Mwalimu Nyerere's vision.

Next, serving as Minister for Natural Resources and Tourism in 1983 and 1984, George Kahama turned his attention to developing and promoting the spectacular game reserves and national parks for which Tanzania is famed worldwide. Then, for the succeeding five years he served as Tanzania's Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary to the People's Republic of China, with concurrent accreditation to

Vietnam, North Korea, Hong Kong and Thailand.

From Beijing he moved to Harare, serving next as the Tanzanian High Commissioner to Zimbabwe in 1989 and 1990.

Then, as the domestic economic reform programmes took root and the Tanzanian government made moves to liberalise the economy and to welcome private and foreign investment, Sir George was recalled to Dar es Salaam in 1990 to establish and run the Tanzanian Investment Promotion Centre (now TIC). He was the Centre's First Director-General, in the President's Office.

Between 1995 and 2000 Sir George continued in Parliament as the MP for Karagwe. George Kahama's last Cabinet portfolio was as Minister for Cooperatives and Marketing, a post he held for five years until his retirement from active politics in November 2005.

Sir George served each of Tanzania's first three Presidents (Nyerere, Mwinyi and Mkapa). He was a man of many accomplishments, discharging each of his responsibilities with an almost boundless energy. Few people, even those in high office, are as fortunate as he to have such opportunities to lay the foundations for the development of a major new nation like Tanzania. Moreover, as a devoted Catholic, Sir George was honoured with two special Presidential assignments. In 1962, he represented President Nyerere at the inaugural meeting of the Second Ecumenical Council in the Vatican, returning to Rome in 2005 to represent President Mkapa at the funeral of Pope John Paul II.

Many in the older generation of Tanzanians remember George Kahama with fondness. In retirement he was Chairman of a number of private Tanzanian companies. He lived with his family in Msasani and is survived by his wife Janet and eight children. After lying-in-State at the Julius Nyerere Convention Centre, followed by a memorial service on 16 March at St Peter's Oysterbay – a service attended by many government and CCM leaders both past and present as well as by other dignitaries – Sir George was laid to rest in Kinondoni Cemetery.

*I had the privilege of working with Sir George in a Commonwealth advisory capacity in the early 1990s when he was heading the Tanzanian Investment Promotion Centre, and I came to know him and some of his family well. I am especially grateful to his eldest surviving son, Richard Kahama, for having*

*provided his Father's detailed CV and for his approval of this Obituary.*

Roger M Nellist *with special thanks to Richard Kahama*

The death of **Philemon Ndesamburo**; business tycoon, Chama cha Demokrasia na Maendeleo (Chadema) co-founder, and former MP, brought the town of Moshi to a standstill as thousands suspended their activities. Current Chadema National Chairman Freeman Mbowe led procession carting the casket through the town. Permission for the procession had initially been denied by the police, but the decision was reversed following a public outcry, though the planned route and destination were altered.

Born on February 19, 1935 in Old Moshi ward, Moshi District in Kilimanjaro Region, went on to become a successful businessman, generous philanthropist and seasoned politician. He was fondly referred by many as Mzee Ndesa while others, due to his sound financial situation, added, Mzee Ndesa Pesa.

With a degree in Agricultural Business from the University of London, UK, in the 1970s he was reportedly posted to a position he considered not conforming to what he studied. Instead, he opted for life out of the government system.

He first ventured openly in politics in pursuit of reforms in 1988 as one of a small group advocating for changes to the national constitution. With the advent of multi-party democracy, he was among the first ten members of Chadema. He lost two hard-fought electoral campaigns against Augustino Mrema, in 1994 for Councillor of Kiboriloni Ward in Moshi and in 1995 for Moshi Urban parliamentary seat, before eventually winning the same seat in the 2000 elections. He held the seat until his retirement in 2015.

But his influence within Chadema extended well beyond his own electoral career. Ndesamburo earned a position for himself as the kingmaker and the financier of last resort to opposition politicians, particularly in northern regions. He also served as Central Committee (CC) member, Kilimanjaro regional chairman, and a member of the Chadema Board of Trustees.

As an opposition politician, Ndesamburo preferred to tell the government what it should do in a persuasive manner rather than adopting

the brash and confrontational style of many opposition politicians. Just a week before his death, he discussed President John Magufuli's industrialisation drive, arguing that it would not attain the desired results if it was not linked to agriculture, which remains the backbone of Tanzania's economy. "The two sectors have to complement each other for the economic take off desired," he said in an interview.

Chadema Co-Founder and first Chairman Edwin Mtei, a senior official in the first phase government, attributed the success of the party to the late Ndesamburo. Mr Mtei who was. "We knew each other since our childhood; we rented and later built houses at nearby areas in Dar es Salaam. We collaborated for a long time since we were at Old Moshi Mahoma and later in the party. We initiated it as an empty set and now it is the main opposition party. ... It is his courage and ability that got us here," said Mr Mtei.

Born in Neath, South Wales, in 1929, **Brian Harris** went to the Neath Grammar School for Boys and then to Aberystwyth University, where he studied agricultural botany and became an expert plant scientist. Later he undertook a PhD. He shared interests in natural history with his wife Sine MacLachlainn, from Mull, who was also a botanist. Brian was eventually appointed to teaching posts with his wife. Together they worked in several African universities including in Ghana, Nigeria and the University of Dar es Salaam, where Brian was Head of Botany.

Brian brought many positive, new ideas to the University of Dar es Salaam: he saw the need for a herbarium and saw to it that the herbarium had a staff, and was himself interested in the campus grounds. He was also a great naturalist and ecologist, including work on bat pollination in African plants.

Following his retirement in 1990, Brian relocated to Edinburgh. But his love of plants and flowers continued as he threw himself into a variety of community projects in the city.

Recently he had suffered from cancer of the larynx, from which he was recovering, but sadly he died after a short illness on 20th April 2017.

*With thanks to Heather Goodare of the Friends of the Meadows and Bruntsfield Links (FOMBL) in Edinburgh, and to Kim Howell.*

**THE DELUSION OF KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER: THE IMPACT OF FOREIGN AID EXPERTS ON POLICY-MAKING IN SOUTH AFRICA AND TANZANIA.** Susanne Koch and Peter Weingart. African Minds, Cape Town, 2016. xii + 384 pp. (paperback). ISBN 978-1-928331-39-1. £40.00.

The aid industry has come under increasing attack in recent years. Indeed, use of the word ‘industry’ in this context already carries pejorative overtones. At first, large insufficiently supported capital projects were the main targets, leading to an increasing emphasis on technical support. In this book, however, the argument is that the latter is also inherently flawed. Are we to conclude then that all attempts to bring assistance to developing countries, no matter how well intentioned, are doomed to failure?

In fact, the authors’ critique is more narrowly focused. Their particular concern is the failure of expert advice to foster ‘the national capacity for self-reliance’. Rather, they argue, ‘the persistent interference by outside actors in our view undermines the development of young into strong democracies as it puts governments at risk of losing control over their own policy agendas (p. 2)’. Related to this, ‘we take it to be a core aspect of sovereignty that states govern themselves and define their own policies (p. 6)’ – shades of Brexit here! A sceptic might object that this rather purist position insufficiently recognises the possibility of governments (not just in developing countries) adopting and pursuing wrong-headed policies (think South Africa and AIDS during the Mbeki years) and that the democratic deficit in policy-making may be due as much to local institutional weaknesses as to over-influential foreign experts. Nevertheless, their ultimate conclusion that more should be done to harness local knowledge and to foster local institutions which can enable such knowledge to play a greater part in the policy process is well made.

In support of their thesis, the authors have carried out case studies in Tanzania and South Africa, covering policy development in education, health and forestry. These are fascinating and the extensive quotations from interviewees merit close study by anyone involved in technical assistance, whether as donors or recipients. In deference to TA readers, we focus here on the Tanzania cases.

In education, the conclusion is that the policy agenda in Tanzania has been ‘hi-jacked’ by the foreign experts involved in the Education Development Partners Group: ‘In a nutshell, the state of education governance in Tanzania could be sketched as follows: the need for foreign financing has legitimated an intense involvement of external actors in the policy space in which aid money

has become the central preoccupation. The prevailing sentiment of being at the mercy of donors has paralysed leadership and administration which fails to set or refrains from articulating an agenda of its own.' One consequence was over-enrolment in schools, beyond the available capacity of either buildings or teachers, leading to falling standards. In contrast, South Africa is found to have been more successful in exploiting outside expertise to create a local vision. This is attributed to: lesser financial dependence on donors; competition between donors, leading to greater responsiveness to local needs and priorities; the careful approach of the authorities towards advice and assistance; and participation of various local stakeholders to counterbalance influence from outside.

The story in health is somewhat different. A number of policy initiatives were taken in the 1990s to rescue Tanzania's health services from the serious decline that had occurred under the structural adjustment policies of the 1980s. This culminated in most donors participating in a constructive 'sector-wide approach' with 'basket funding' under strong Tanzanian leadership. However, this benign arrangement was then disrupted by the entry of global health initiatives with massive financial backing, particularly in relation to HIV/AIDS. Up to this point, Tanzanian policy gave priority to prevention and mitigation measures. With hundreds of millions of dollars on offer, the Tanzanians had little option but to go along with the programmes and policies imposed by the Global Fund, PEPFAR and the Clinton Foundation, which emphasised treatment with anti-retroviral drugs, despite practical difficulties in implementing such a policy. Moreover, one of the most problematic issues related to the entry of global health initiatives in Tanzania was that 'they not only shifted the bulk of the HIV budget to treatment but also skewed the overall resource allocation in health towards HIV/AIDS at the expense of other crucial areas and prevalent diseases (p. 249).' In addition, 'While the dialogue forums in health and HIV/AIDS were actually established to reduce donor influence and induce a more distant form of advice, it *de facto* brought aid actors closer to decision-making insofar as it entrenched their participation in policy development, analysis and evaluation (p. 257)'. Meanwhile, South Africa was more successful in harnessing outside finance and advice in support of its own agenda (at least, once Aaron Motsoaledi had become Health Minister).

The third case covered environmental policy, particularly forestry. Here external advice played a large part in mainstreaming environmental policy in Tanzania and helping to secure passage of the Forest Act (2002) and the Environmental Management Act (2004), which was regarded as a model of its kind. However,

disillusion soon set in. A combination of low priority for environmental actions in budget setting, misappropriation of funds and insufficient administrative capacity resulted in a situation where ‘environmental policies and legislation are hardly put into practice (p. 290)’. In response, donor support either faded away or was redirected into the new international enthusiasm for REDD+ (Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation). Again, South Africa did better, thanks mainly to strong local expertise.

The concluding chapters of the book review the relative importance of financial strength, administrative capacity and the local knowledge base in the light of the case studies. They find that ‘it is insufficient to explain external influence on policy-making with a single factor.’ The final chapter heading nevertheless is ‘There is no substitute for local knowledge’ and the authors make suggestions to strengthen its influence. Evidently this cannot be a quick fix, leaving open the question how donors and recipients are supposed to work constructively together in the meantime. The case studies do however offer some pointers as to how the more egregious practices can be avoided. For those keen to learn more, the book includes a very full bibliography.

Hugh Wenban-Smith

**THE ENDURING RELEVANCE OF WALTER RODNEY’S ‘HOW EUROPE UNDERDEVELOPED AFRICA’.** Karim Hirji. Daraja Press, Montreal, 2017. 134 pp. (paperback). ISBN 978-0-9952223-9-7. £8.80.

Karim Hirji argues succinctly that Walter Rodney’s inspirational book, *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa (HEUA)*, retains its long-term relevance because it articulates a strategy for the total economic independence of Africa as well as the emancipation of Africa and its people. Hirji knew Rodney personally and he explains that as the struggles for independence matured, a Marxist strand of political economy which demonstrated that Europe has an exploitative relationship with Africa emerged. Rodney was not a mechanical borrower of ideas from other progressives. He was a critical scholar and classical Marxist whose theoretical framework of analysis was based on Marxist political economy.

From the 15th century onwards African societies came under the hegemony of western imperialism, and colonial policies prevented genuine capitalist development. Rodney thought that the African masses must take the control of state power, disengage from the global capitalist system, adopt socialism, and use its wealth to develop society. He proposed a strategy of integrated

economic development for the liberation of African nations, but his book became a target for elitist right-wing intellectuals for its anti-imperialist stance. Its content, methods and conclusions were scrutinised by many, including some progressive academics. Because Rodney advanced the Marxist idea that economic factors are the primary motor of African history, he is accused of economic determinism by conventional historians who fail to see anything wrong with the cultural and demographic determinism that they adopt in their own analyses.

Another criticism of Rodney's book is its explanation of the role played by external factors in the transformation of Africa during the slave trade and after. Rodney understood capitalism as a global system and imperialism as an economically-driven phenomenon facilitating the extraction of surplus, and so the underdevelopment of Africa. However, some African and Western scholars argue that Rodney's thesis is not relevant for the postcolonial period, and that poverty in Africa cannot be attributed to imperialism but instead must be blamed on corrupt leadership. Their proposed solution is the adoption of neoliberal policies with economic liberalisation and the promotion of foreign investment. As Hirji points out, this is an approach that merely pretends to scientific objectivity.

Rodney wrote about a continent that had been exploited for centuries. His work had to be exceptional because he was breaking the silence that had been maintained by academia itself. And in order to expose the truth of Africa's underdevelopment he brought in new ideas and adopted a unique style. Rodney was a committed Marxist scholar and activist who continually enhanced his perspective through study and struggle. While engaging with local realities on 'The Hill', his views evolved. By the mid-1970s he had realised that the rhetoric of Tanzanian socialism masked the neocolonial dependency being implemented in the country.

He mingled with both intellectuals and the masses. I first met Rodney during his lecture on the Cuban Revolution at the University of Dar es Salaam. He was a very powerful orator and captivated the academic audience. Together with Hirji, Issa Shivji and other comrades, we went with him to the Ujamaa villages in Bagamoyo and Dodoma to work with the peasants. Personally, I treasure the few days that I spent with him when he had fallen sick while on his way to Njombe with his wife Pat and children, Asha, Shaka and Kanini. He stopped over at our humble home in Mzumbe, Morogoro, and my wife Salha and I were able to spend a few days with him and his family while he recuperated.

Hirji points out that the main theme of *HEUA* remains as relevant for Africa



today as it did in 1972 when it was first published. The book enables one to understand the continent's past and the path it is taking, as well as the grave social economic problems that Africa has faced. The result was a ground-breaking work of scholarship. For the first time the real causes of underdevelopment in Africa were exposed, and Rodney's book was widely read in Africa and the Caribbean.

Today, however, there are conscious efforts in some quarters to disqualify Rodney's thesis. Indeed, most historians now studying African history hardly ever make reference to him. Even in the university seminar rooms, *HEUA* seems to be completely forgotten. Students rarely read a fair depiction of the contribution of Rodney's Marxist approach: instead he is often misquoted. It is therefore timely for Hirji to remind us of his magisterial work. He discusses Rodney as a humane revolutionary and radical scholar who supported student activism and radical writing in the campuses of different universities. Despite determined attempts to silence Rodney, his inspiration to change the society for the better and fight for a just and non-racial future remains strong.

Georgios Hadjivayanis

**JOHN THOMAS MHINA SEPEKU, ASKOFU MKUU WA KWANZA, KANISA ANGLIKANA, TANZANIA.** Augustino S.L.Ramadhani. Mkuki na Nyota, Dar es Salaam, 2017. 287 pp. (paperback). ISBN 978-9987-75-394-9. TSh. 25,000.

John Sepeku was one of the outstanding personalities in the first generation of church leaders following national independence. Born in Misozwe, Tanga, in 1908, he became first Anglican Bishop of Dar es Salaam in 1965, and first Archbishop of the Anglican Province of Tanzania in 1970. He was educated at St. Andrew's College, Minaki, Kisarawe, one of the two best existing secondary schools. In his final year when Sepeku was Head Prefect, the Headmaster, Canon Gibbons, commented: "Has the courage of his convictions. Is a leader and has real 'dini' (that is, genuine religious faith). Cannot speak too highly of him."

The author is himself an outstanding personality. Augustino Ramadhani was Chief Judge of Zanzibar from 1980-89, then Chief Judge of Tanzania from 2007-10, and finally President of Africa's International Court of Human Rights. Before his retirement as judge in 2016, the author was ordained as an Anglican priest in Zanzibar in 2013. He knew John Sepeku very well, and this excellent biography has been written out of love and gratitude.

It is now 34 years since Sepeku died. Inevitably there are a few gaps in the story, but the author has brilliantly succeeded in writing an extensive account of his life, by using a variety of written sources, as well as live interviews. As the author remarks, his book is more than a biography. It is also a brief history of the Anglican Church, tracing it back to the days of David Livingstone's appeal, made to British and Irish universities in 1857, to send missionaries to rid Africa of the scourge of the slave trade, and to spread the light of Christianity. It was this historic appeal which led directly to the founding of the Universities' Mission to Central Africa (UMCA), which in 1965 was incorporated in the United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (USPG). John Sepeku was nurtured in this ecclesiastical tradition, but never restricted by it. He formed friendships across church boundaries, and both as bishop and archbishop sought to bring harmony and break down divisions.

In 1960 the Anglican Province of East Africa was inaugurated, bringing together for the first time the two different missionary traditions of the UMCA and the CMS (Church Missionary Society) into one autonomous body. When the diocese of Dar es Salaam was founded in 1965, Sepeku became its first bishop. From the start he welcomed and made provision for Christians from the evangelical 'CMS' dioceses, and co-operated closely with Gresford Chitemo, his neighbouring bishop in Morogoro. Then, in 1970, just two days before the nation celebrated its National Independence Day, the Church of the Province of Tanzania was inaugurated. John Sepeku was enthroned as its first archbishop, having been elected by his seven fellow bishops in Tanzania. Chosen by the Archbishop of Canterbury to preside at the closing Eucharist of the Lambeth Conference in 1978, he stepped down as archbishop in the same year, and continued as bishop until he died in 1983.

Often called the 'farmer' bishop because of his 'hands-on' commitment to developing diocesan land for horticulture, John Sepeku was also instrumental in providing urban land in the city for educational and social projects, such as the Kichwele Women's Hostel for single girls, St. Mark's Theological College, and a School for Deaf Children.

As archbishop, John Sepeku travelled widely throughout Tanzania, building on his knowledge of the different backgrounds and church traditions to bring about a sense of a genuinely indigenous Tanzanian church, diverse but essentially one.

A natural leader, who could be authoritarian and stern, John Sepeku was widely acknowledged to be at heart a humble pastor, compassionate and just, whose

advice was sought not only by bishops and priests but also by government leaders. Judge Ramadhani has written a masterly book in which he brings out clearly the exceptional qualities of this great church leader. He has written a brief English synopsis. The book is now awaiting a full translation, but meanwhile it should be recommended reading for all current and aspiring leaders of church and state.

Graeme Watson

## TANZANIAN AFFAIRS (ISSN 0952-2948)

EDITOR and *POLITICS, ECONOMICS, TRANSPORT, HEALTH*: **Ben Taylor**. E-mail: ben.d.taylor@gmail.com.

GRAPHICS, ELECTRONIC PUBLISHING: **Jacob Knight**. E-mail: jacob@kwangu.com

CO-EDITOR and *TZ IN THE INTERNATIONAL MEDIA*: **Donovan McGrath**. Tel: 020 8960 6668. E-mail: mzee.mzima@talktalk.net

*FOREIGN RELATIONS* and *AGRICULTURE*: **David Brewin**, 14 Westbourne Grove Terrace, London W2 5SD. Tel: 020 7727 1755. E-mail: davidbrewin@btinternet.com

*CONSTITUTION*: **Enos Bukuku**, Flat 4, 66 Avenue Road, Highgate, London N6 5DR. Tel: 020 8826 1365 or 020 8881 7777. E-mail: enosbukuku@gmail.com

*TOURISM & ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION*: **Mark Gillies**. Tel: 0121 382 9000. E-mail: mark.gillies@audleytravel.com

*ENERGY & MINERALS*: **Roger Nellist**. Tel: 020 8566 1629 Mob: 07985 394349 E-mail: rogermnellist@hotmail.com

*EDUCATION*: **Naomi Rouse**. E-mail: nmrouse@gmail.com

*SPORT*: **Philip Richards**. E-mail: philip.r.richards@gmail.com

*DEVELOPMENT RESEARCH*: **Hugh Wenban-Smith**. E-mail: wenban@globalnet.co.uk

BOOK REVIEWS EDITOR: **Martin Walsh**. E-mail: kisutu@virginmedia.com

DISTRIBUTION MANAGER: **Jill Bowden**, 17 The Green, London N14 7EH. Tel: 020 8886 8141. E-mail: jillbowde@gmail.com

## BRITAIN-TANZANIA SOCIETY

Readers wishing to join the Britain-Tanzania Society should contact the membership secretary:

**Petronilla Mwakatuma**, Flat 23, 18 Bramley Hill, Croydon CR2 6LZ. Tel: 020 3560 6398 E-mail: mwakatumap@gmail.com

[www.britaintanzaniasociety.co.uk](http://www.britaintanzaniasociety.co.uk)

[www.tzaffairs.org](http://www.tzaffairs.org)



## CONTRIBUTORS

**Dr Georgios Hadjivayanis** is a retired Associate Professor of Sociology and Social Anthropology. He did his undergraduate and postgraduate studies at the University of Dar es Salaam where he was actively involved in student politics. His memoir of that period is published in *Cheche* which was edited by Karim Hirji. He did his doctoral studies at Pantheon Sorbonne in France. He was one of the founding Directors of Haki Ardhi, and taught at Mzumbe and Sokoine universities in Morogoro prior to moving to South Africa. He is currently based in London.

**Revd Graeme Watson** worked as a missionary priest and teacher in Tanzania from 1967 to 1977. He was Tutor at St. Cyprian's College, Lindi, 1967-77; Vice-Principal of St. Mark's Theological College, Dar es Salaam, 1969-73; and Rector of St. Alban's Church, Dar es Salaam, 1974- 77.

**Hugh Wenban-Smith** was born in Chunya and went to Mbeya School. His career was as a government economist (mainly in Britain, but with periods in Zambia and India). He is now an independent research economist, with particular interests in infrastructure, urbanisation and transport.

**The views expressed or reported in *Tanzanian Affairs* are those of the person concerned and do not necessarily represent the views of the Britain-Tanzania Society**

## SUBSCRIPTIONS

Three issues per annum: UK: £15.00

Outside UK: £18.00 or US\$38.00 or Euros €29.00 (includes postage)

Back issues: £2.50 each, Special 100th Edition (1975-2011): £4.00 plus postage